FY 2023-24 and FY 2024-25 Departmental Budget Presentation
BOS Budget and Appropriations Committee

June 14, 2023

Gayathri Thaikkendiyil,
Acting Executive Director
## Overview of Proposed Department Operating Budget - General Fund

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ETH Budget</th>
<th>FY23</th>
<th>FY24</th>
<th>Percent Change From FY23</th>
<th>FY25</th>
<th>Percent Change From FY24</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating Budget</td>
<td>$7,139,993</td>
<td>$6,781,749</td>
<td>-5%</td>
<td>$4,883,027</td>
<td>-28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authorized Positions</td>
<td>34.44</td>
<td>34.63</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>24.63</td>
<td>-29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgeted FTEs*</td>
<td>31.43</td>
<td>28.80</td>
<td>-8%</td>
<td>18.84</td>
<td>-35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* With reductions in Salary and Fringe due to attrition savings and Mayor’s proposed reductions.

Comparing current authorized positions to budgeted FTEs, the total effective FTE reduction will be 47% by FY25.

## Overview of Proposed Contributions to Election Campaign Fund

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Election Campaign Fund Contribution</th>
<th>FY23</th>
<th>FY24</th>
<th>FY25</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$446,860</td>
<td>$446,860</td>
<td>$3,702,199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mayor’s Budget Proposal in Summary

- **Continue currently filled staff positions** and retain IS Engineer position (approved for only FY23-24).

- **Fill two positions** - Executive Director and Form 700 Client Support Specialist position (approved for only FY23-24).

- **Not fill any** remaining vacancies for two years. Ten positions are currently vacant in total (vacancy rate is 29%).

- **Let 10 positions expire** by June 30, 2024, impacting 7 current staff. Creates significant attrition risk in FY24.

- **Reduce total staffing** by 16 positions out of 34 authorized positions (47% reduction) by FY25.

- **Insufficient funding for key positions** required to fulfill charter mandates and essential functions.
Campaign Finance Reform Ordinance (CFRO) Administration for 2024 Elections

**Priority**

Monitor and enforce compliance with campaign finance laws, provide filer assistance and advice, conduct charter mandated filing officer duties, audit publicly financed campaigns and eliminate backlog, and provide online tools for the public and press to track campaign finance activity for the **March and November 2024 elections**.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Mayor’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Starting FY23-24</td>
<td><strong>Continue</strong> funding for expiring IS Engineer position (one 1043). <strong>Leave all campaign finance compliance positions vacant for two years</strong> (one 1844 and one 1824).</td>
<td><strong>Online tools</strong> for public and press to <strong>track campaign finance activity</strong> will be <strong>available</strong> for the <strong>March 2024 election</strong>. <strong>Inability to fulfill charter mandated filing officer duties. Insufficient staffing to monitor compliance</strong> with campaign finance laws, administer public financing program, or provide filer support for campaigns with disclosure obligations involved in the <strong>2024 elections</strong>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting FY24-25</td>
<td><strong>Discontinue</strong> funding for IS Engineer position (one 1043). In addition to leaving campaign finance compliance positions vacant, <strong>discontinue</strong> funding for campaign finance investigator (one 1823).</td>
<td><strong>Online tools</strong> for public and press to <strong>track campaign finance activity</strong> will be <strong>discontinued</strong> for the <strong>November 2024 election</strong>. <strong>Insufficient staffing to enforce campaign finance laws for 2024 election cycle</strong>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Enforcement

### Priority

Continue to execute **BLA recommended plan** to reduce investigative case closure times, resolve all investigations within two years, and monitor and track performance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Mayor’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Starting FY23-24</td>
<td><strong>Continue</strong> funding for expiring <strong>IS Engineer</strong> position (one 1043).</td>
<td><strong>Continue technical support for case management system</strong> in FY24.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|                   | **Reduce investigative staffing** by 25% from FY23 (one 1822 Investigator and one 1823 Senior Investigator). | **Ethics Commission has increased case closure rates (see Appendix D) as recommended by the BLA.** This proposal will return performance to FY21 levels (below) by FY25:  
  ➢ 50% increase in time taken to close cases.  
  ➢ 322% increase in average days to complete preliminary review.  
  **High attrition risk in FY24** though positions are expiring in FY25. |
| Starting FY24-25  | **Reduce investigative staffing** by 50% from FY23 (one 1822 Investigator and three 1823 Senior Investigators). | **Discontinue technical support for case management system** in FY25. This will impact the ability to monitor and track performance as recommended by the BLA. |
|                   | **Discontinue** funding for **IS Engineer** position (one 1043).                                             |                                                                        |
### Ethics Training and Education for City Employees (Ethics@Work Program)

**Priority**

Train City employees on governmental ethics and develop multi-lingual resources on topics including Form 700, conflict of interest, whistleblowing, gifts, behested payments, and secondary employment.

### Impacts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Mayor’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Starting FY24-25 | Discontinue funding for four staff training and education positions (one 1824, two 1823s, and one 1230). | ➢ Fails to address City work culture that led to federal probe and indictments of top City officials.  
➢ Ends the Commission’s ethics training and education programs for City employees in FY25.  
➢ Creates disincentives for departments to participate in ethics training and education programs in FY24 if program is to be terminated in FY25.  
➢ Terminates existing training and education plans underway with City departments effective June 30, 2024.  
➢ High attrition risk in FY24 though positions are expiring in FY25. |
Citywide Form 700 Program Administration

**Priority**

Administer **Citywide Form 700 program**, provide filer and filing officer **advice and e-filing technical support**, conduct filing officer duties, and **make disclosures available to the public online**.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Mayor’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Starting FY23-24</td>
<td>Continue funding for expiring <strong>Client Support Specialist</strong> position (one 1840).</td>
<td>Continue Form 700 client support for filers and filing officers through June 2024.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Continue funding for expiring <strong>IS Engineer</strong> position (one 1043).</td>
<td>Continue publishing new Form 700 disclosure data accessible to the public on DataSF through June 2024.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting FY24-25</td>
<td>Discontinue funding for expiring <strong>Client Support Specialist</strong> position (one 1840).</td>
<td>Insufficient staffing to provide Form 700 filer and filing officer e-filing technical support starting July 2024.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discontinue funding for <strong>IS Engineer</strong> position (one 1043).</td>
<td>Discontinue publishing new Form 700 disclosure data accessible to the public on DataSF starting July 2024.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Summary of Funding Needed to Maintain Commission’s Essential Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programs</th>
<th>FY23-24</th>
<th>FY24-25</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Systems Staff</strong>&lt;br&gt;1043 IS Engineer&lt;br&gt;Minimum staffing to cover IS engineering needs for Campaign Finance, Enforcement, and Form 700 administration</td>
<td>$250k</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Campaign Finance Compliance Staff</strong>&lt;br&gt;1824 Engagement &amp; Compliance Manager &amp; 1844 Engagement &amp; Compliance Officer&lt;br&gt;Minimum staffing needed for 2024 election campaign finance compliance</td>
<td>$392k</td>
<td>$403k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Enforcement Staff</strong>&lt;br&gt; (Starting FY23-24) 1823 Senior Investigator &amp; 1822 Investigator&lt;br&gt;(Starting FY24-25) Two additional 1823 Senior Investigators&lt;br&gt;Minimum staffing needed for Enforcement division to continue to meet BLA recommendations</td>
<td>$357k</td>
<td>$758k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethics Training &amp; Education Staff</strong>&lt;br&gt;1824 Program Manager, two 1823 Training and Outreach Specialists, &amp; 1230 Training Design Specialist&lt;br&gt;Minimum staffing needed to continue the ethics training &amp; education programs for City employees</td>
<td>$811k</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Form 700 Program Administration</strong>&lt;br&gt;1840 Client Support Specialist&lt;br&gt;Minimum staffing needed to continue providing timely support to filers and filing officers in FY25</td>
<td>$142k</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Funding Gap</strong></td>
<td>$749k</td>
<td>$2.36m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics Commission Organization Chart

Executive Director (0961)  
(Vacant)

Deputy Director & COO (0951)

1454 Executive Secretary (Vacant)

Engagement & Compliance  
= 6

Education & Training (Ethics@Work)  
= 4

Policy  
= 2

Audits  
= 4

Enforcement  
= 8

Electronic Disclosure & Data Analysis  
= 4

1824 Engagement & Compliance Manager (Vacant)  
1823 Sr. Program Administrator  
1844 Engagement & Compliance Officer  
1844 Engagement & Compliance Officer (Vacant)  
1840 Client Support Specialist (Vacant) (Proposed funding until June 2024)  
1406 Sr. Administrative Coordinator

1824 Program Manager (Funding expires June 2024)  
1823 Training & Outreach Specialist (Funding expires June 2024)  
1823 Training & Outreach Specialist (Funding expires June 2024)  
1230 Training Design Specialist (Funding expires June 2024)

1824 Policy & Legislative Affairs Manager (Vacant)  
1823 Sr. Policy Analyst

1824 Audit & Compliance Review Manager  
1822 Auditor  
1822 Auditor  
1822 Auditor

0922 Director of Enforcement  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst (Funding expires June 2024)  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst (Funding expires June 2024)  
1823 Sr. Investigative Analyst (Vacant) (Funding expires June 2024)  
1822 Investigative Analyst (Vacant)

- 34 Authorized positions in FY23
- Nine vacancies (excluding ED)
- Funding for ten positions expire by June 2024

1054 Director of Technology Services  
1053 Sr. IS Analyst  
1052 IS Analyst  
1043 Sr. IS Engineer (Proposed funding until June 2024)
# Ethics Commission Staffing Levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staffing</th>
<th>FY20</th>
<th>FY21</th>
<th>FY22</th>
<th>FY23</th>
<th>FY24 Proposed</th>
<th>FY25 Proposed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Authorized Positions</td>
<td>24.53</td>
<td>24.75</td>
<td>31.84</td>
<td>34.44</td>
<td>34.63</td>
<td>24.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgeted FTEs*</td>
<td>23.26</td>
<td>22.34</td>
<td>30.50</td>
<td>31.43</td>
<td>28.80</td>
<td>18.84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*With reductions in Salary and Fringe due to attrition savings and Mayor’s proposed reductions as applicable.*

* Historical data from the City’s Salary Ordinance
APPENDIX D: Enforcement Charts

Enforcement Performance Measures

Number of Cases Completed

- FY 2019-20: 89
- FY 2020-21: 77
- FY 2021-22: 94
- FY 2022-23 (7/1/22-6/12/23): 154

Average Days to Complete Preliminary Review

- FY 2019-20: 248
- FY 2020-21: 313
- FY 2021-22: 117
- FY 2022-23 (7/1/22-6/12/23): 97